THE UK RESEARCH ASSESSMENT EXERCISE AND THE NARROWING OF

UK ECONOMICS

By

Professor Frederic S. Lee1

Dr. Xuan Pham2

Dr. Gyun Gu3

APPENDIX

February 18, 2013

Economics Department1 US Department of Korea Institute for Local Finance3

UMKC Agriculture2 11-13, Yeouido-dong,

5100 Rockhill Road 6501 Beacon Drive Yeongdeungpo-gu

Kansas City, Mo. 64110 Kansas City, Mo. 64133 Seoul, 150-868, South Korea

E-mail: [leefs@umkc.edu](mailto:leefs@umkc.edu) E-mail: [xhp4y8@gmail.com](mailto:xhp4y8@gmail.com) E-mail: [ggu@kilf.re.kr](mailto:ggu@kilf.re.kr)

ABSTRACT

The aim of this paper is to delineate an empirical grounded structure-causal, going concern, recursive model of UK economics that, in the context of the RAE and local department decision-making, explains the progressive elimination of heterodox economics, the progressive homogenization of mainstream economics from 1992 to the present, and the continued rise to dominance of a select group of departments, and indicates whether these ‘regularities’ will continue under the Research Excellence Framework selectivity exercise in 2014.

Key words: UK Economics, Research Assessment Exercise, Critical Realism

JEL Code: A14, B5, A11

APPENDIX I

**RAE Quality Assessment Rating and HEFCE Funding Weights**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Description | Assessment Rating | | | | Funding Weights | | | |
|  | 1992 | 1996 | 2001 | 2008 | 1992 | 1996 | 2001 | 2008 |
| **Research Quality based in International**  **Excellence (IE)** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| World Leading |  |  |  | 4\* |  |  |  | 7.00 |
| Less than World  Leading |  |  |  | 3\* |  |  |  | 3.00 |
| International Quality |  |  |  | 2\* |  |  |  | 1.00 |
| **Research Quality based on the combination of International and National Excellence (NE)** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| More than 50% of the subareas attain IE  And the rest attain NE |  | 5\* | 5\* |  |  | 4.05 | 3.375 |  |
| Up to 50% of the subareas attain IE and the rest attain NE | 5 | 5 | 5 |  | 4.00 | 3.375 | 2.25 |  |
| Some evidence of IE and the rest of the subareas attain NE | 4 | 4 | 4 |  | 3.00 | 2.25 | 1.50 |  |
| **Research Quality based on National Excellence** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Virtually all research attains NE |  |  |  | 1\* |  |  |  | 0.00 |
| Over 66% of the subareas attain NE |  | 3a | 3a |  |  | 1.50 | 1.00 |  |
| More than 50% of the subareas attain NE | 3 | 3b | 3b |  | 2.00 | 1.00 | 0.00 |  |
| Less than 50% of the subareas attain NE | 2 | 2 | 2 |  | 1.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |  |
| None of the subareas attain NE | 1 | 1 | 1 |  | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |  |

*Notes*: Various HEFCE reports; also see <http://www.hefce.ac.uk/research/ref/reform/>.

APPENDIX II

Distribution of RAE Quality Research Funding Among Universities

**1992 RAE**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Submitted Staff | Total QR Funds  1993-4 to 1996-7 | QR Funding per Staff  per Year | QR Funding Share  (%) |
| Research Rating-5 | 10 | 357 | £30,398,660 | £21,288 | 59.7 |
| Research Rating-4 | 9 | 167.8 | £10,118,833 | £15,076 | 19.9 |
| Research Rating-31 | 14 | 213.5 | £8,469,573 | £9,918 | 16.6 |
| Research Rating-2 | 9 | 96.1 | £1,918,981 | £4,992 | 3.8 |
| Research Rating-1 | 4 | 28 | £0 | £0 | 0.0 |
| Non-Research Rated  Universities in Economics | 25 | - | - | - | - |
| Total | 712 | 860.43 | £50,906,0474 | £14,791 | 100.00 |

**1996 RAE**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Staff | Total QR Funds  1997-8 to 2001-02 | QR Funding per Staff per Year | QR Funding Share  (%) |
| Research Rating-5\* | 3 | 114.44 | £15,074,243 | £26,344 | 26.7 |
| Research Rating-5 | 10 | 256.38 | £24,879,665 | £19,408 | 44.1 |
| Research Rating -4 | 11 | 187.44 | £12,089,332 | £12,899 | 21.4 |
| Research Rating-3a | 9 | 88.66 | £3,752,164 | £8,464 | 6.6 |
| Research Rating-3b | 2 | 25.9 | £672,460 | £5,193 | 1.2 |
| Research Rating-2 | 3 | 21.2 | £0 | £0 | 0.0 |
| Research Rating-1 | 0 | - | £0 | £0 | 0.0 |
| Non-Research Rated  Universities in Economics | 36 | - | - | - | - |
| Total | 745 | 672.886 | £56,467,8647 | £16,785 | 100.0 |

**2001 RAE**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Staff | Total QR Funds  2002-03 to 2008-09 | QR Funding per Staff per Year | QR Funding Share  (%) |
| Research Rating-5\* | 4 | 130.00 | £32,369,200 | £35,570 | 35.0 |
| Research Rating-5 | 9 | 262.56 | £49,007,083 | £26,664 | 53.0 |
| Research Rating -4 | 11 | 165.02 | £10,759,243 | £9,314 | 11.7 |
| Research Rating-3a | 8 | 94.60 | £280,66010 | £424 | 0.3 |
| Research Rating-3b | 1 | 7.0 | £0 | £0 | - |
| Research Rating-2 | 0 | - | £0 | £0 | - |
| Research Rating-1 | 0 | - | £0 | £0 | - |
| Non-Research Rated  Universities in Economics | 34  (average) | - | - | - | - |
| Total | 678 | 659.189 | £92,416,18611 | £20,028 | 100.0 |

**2008 RAE**12

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Submitted Staff | Total QR Funds  2009-10 to 2012-13 | QR Funding per Staff per Year | QR Funding Share  (%) |
| Research Rating-3.55-3.35 | 5 | 206.43 | £29,662,983 | £35,924 | 44.2 |
| Research Rating-3.15-2.95 | 8 | 225.75 | £21,007,065 | £23,264 | 31.3 |
| Research Rating -2.90-  2.45 | 12 | 239.83 | £16,042,128 | £16,722 | 23.9 |
| Research Rating-2.25-1.70 | 3 | 16.75 | £431,472 | £6,440 | 0.6 |
| Non-Research Rated  Universities in Economics | 40  (average) | - | - | - | - |
| Total | 6813 | 688.7614 | £67,143,64815 | £24,371 | 100.0 |

*Notes*:

1Although the School of Slavonic and East European Studies was awarded a research rating of three, it did not receive any QR Funding after 1993-94.

2Derived from economics student enrollment data for 1994-95 supplied by the Higher Education Statistical Agency – contact the author (Lee) for details.

3Derived from the Research Assessment Exercise 1992 for economics: <http://www.rae.ac.uk>.

4Provided by the HEFCE – contact the author (Lee) for details.

5Derived from economics student enrollment data for 1997-98 supplied by the Higher Education Statistical Agency – contact the author (Lee) for details.

6 Derived from HEFCE funding data: <http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20100202100434/http:/hefce.ac.uk/research/funding/qrfunding/previous.asp>.

7Derived from HEFCE funding data: <http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20100202100434/http:/hefce.ac.uk/research/funding/qrfunding/previous.asp>.

8Derived from economics student enrollment data supplied by the Higher Education Statistical Agency – contact the author (Lee) for details.

9Derived from HEFCE funding data: <http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20100202100434/http:/hefce.ac.uk/research/funding/qrfunding/previous.asp>.

10The eight universities with 3a research rating received QR funding for only 2002-03.

11Derived from HEFCE funding data: <http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20100202100434/http:/hefce.ac.uk/research/funding/qrfunding/previous.asp>.

12The research rating scores for the 2008 RAE are derived by multiplying the percentage of research activity by its corresponding quality level and then summing. For example, for Birkbeck College, it is the following: (.2)(4) + (.5)(3) + (.25)(2) + (.05)(1) = 2.85.

13Derived from economics student enrollment data supplied by the Higher Education Statistical Agency – contact the author (Lee) for details.

14Derived from the Research Assessment Exercise 2008 for economics: <http://www.rae.ac.uk>.

15Derived from HEFCE funding data: <http://www.hefce.ac.uk/data/>.

APPENDIX III

New Universities and RAE

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **University** | **1992** | **1996** | **2001** | **2008¹** |
| Buckinghamshire College of Higher Education | 1 |  |  |  |
| University of Central Lancashire | 1 |  |  |  |
| De Montfort University | 3 | 3b |  |  |
| University of East London | 2 | 3a | 3a |  |
| Kingston University | 2 |  |  | 2.00 |
| London Guildhall University/London Metropolitan University | 2 | 3b | 3a | 2.25 |
| Manchester Metropolitan University | 2 | 3a | 3a | 1.70 |
| University of Northumbria at Newcastle | 2 | 2 | 3b |  |
| Nottingham Trent University | 1 | 2 |  |  |
| University of Portsmouth | 2 | 3a |  |  |
| Staffordshire University | 2 | 2 |  |  |
| Thames Valley University | 1 |  |  |  |
|  | **1994-65 to**  **1996-97** | **1997-98 to**  **2001-02** | **2002-03 to**  **2008-09** | **2009-10 to**  **2012-13** |
| Total Amount of QR Funding | £ | £ | £ | £ |
| Total Amount of QR Funding for New Universities | £1,631,006 | £1,514,041 | £77,619 | £431,472 |
| Percentage of QR Funding for New Universities | 3.2 | 2.7 | 0.1 | 0.6 |

*Notes*:

1The research rating scores for the 2008 RAE are derived by multiplying the percentage of research activity by its corresponding quality level and then summing—see Appendix IV

APPENDIX IV

Proportion of Diamond List Publications in RAE-Submissions in 1992, 2001 and 2008

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Name | 1992  Research  Ratings1 | Diamond List Publications in Total RAE Submissions 1992 (%) | 2001  Research Ratings | Diamond List Publication in total RAE Submissions 2001 (%) | 2008  Research Ratings2 | Diamond List Publication in total RAE Submissions 2008 (%) |
| London School of Economics and Political Science | 5 | 26 | 5\* | 34 | 3.55 | 58 |
| University College London |  |  | 5\* | 46 | 3.50 | 57 |
| University of Warwick | 5 | 28 | 5\* | 41 | 3.35 | 41 |
| University of Oxford |  |  | 5 | 21 | 3.35 | 34 |
| University of Essex | 5 | 42 | 5\* | 54 | 3.35 | 45 |
| University of Nottingham |  |  | 5 | 35 | 3.15 | 36 |
| University of Bristol |  |  | 4 | 31 | 3.15 | 37 |
| Queen Mary and Westfield College | 4 | 18 | 5 | 39 | 3.15 | 42 |
| University of Cambridge |  |  | 5 | 22 | 3.05 | 28 |
| University of Manchester |  |  | 4 | 19 | 3.05 | 21 |
| University of Southampton |  |  | 5 | 27 | 3.00 | 27 |
| Royal Holloway and Bedford New College |  |  | 4 | 49 | 3.00 | 42 |
| University of Exeter | 4 | 23 | 5 | 52 | 2.95 | 39 |
| University of Leicester | 3 | 29 | 5 | 34 | 2.90 | 25 |
| University of Kent |  |  | 4 | 17 | 2.90 | 21 |
| Birkbeck College | 5 | 33 | 5 | 39 | 2.85 | 21 |
| University of Sheffield |  |  | 3a | 8 | 2.80 | 21 |
| University of Surrey | 3 | 8 | 3a | 17 | 2.80 | 28 |
| University of Birmingham |  |  | 4 | 2 | 2.75 | 9 |
| University of East Anglia |  |  | 4 | 19 | 2.75 | 24 |
| University of York | 5 | 17 | 5 | 27 | 2.75 | 14 |
| University of Sussex |  |  | 4 | 8 | 2.70 | 8 |
| Brunel University |  |  | 4 | 33 | 2.65 | 16 |
| City University | 3 | 15 | 3a | 11 | 2.65 | 12 |
| Loughborough University | 3 | 6 | 3a | 8 | 2.45 | 4 |
| London Guildhall University/ London Metropolitan University | 2 | 6 | 3a | 18 | 2.25 | 6 |
| Kingston University |  |  |  |  | 2.00 |  |
| Manchester Metropolitan University |  |  | 3a | 15 | 1.70 | 0 |
| University of Newcastle | 4 | 36 | 4 | 26 |  |  |
| University of Reading | 4 | 8 |  |  |  |  |
| University of Bath | 3 | 13 |  |  |  |  |
| De Montfort University | 3 | 0 |  |  |  |  |
| University of Durham | 3 | 0 | 4 | 38 |  |  |
| University of Hull | 3 | 13 |  |  |  |  |
| University of East London | 2 | 0 | 3a | 15 |  |  |
| University of Staffordshire | 2 | 0 |  |  |  |  |
| University of Salford | 2 | 5 |  |  |  |  |
| Keele University |  |  | 3a | 14 |  |  |
| University of Liverpool |  |  | 4 | 21 |  |  |
| University of Northumbria |  |  | 3b | 8 |  |  |
| Total RAE Submissions |  | 18 (840) |  | 28 (2789)3 |  | 39 (2604)5 |
| All Journal and Similar Submissions |  | 31 (500) |  | 32 (2493)4 |  | 44 (2357)6 |

*Notes*:

1Source: Twenty-one 1992 RAE Economic Departments Publications Submissions Collected by John R. Presely in 1993-1994. Copies in the possession of the author (Lee).

2The research rating scores for the 2008 RAE are derived by multiplying the percentage of research activity by its corresponding quality level and then summing. For example, for Birkbeck College, it is the following: (.2)(4) + (.5)(3) + (.25)(2) + (.05)(1) = 2.85.

3Total number of 2001 submissions to the RAE Economics and Econometrics Panel

4Total number of 2001 journal submissions to the RAE Economics and Econometrics Panel.

5Total number of 2008 submissions to the RAE Economics and Econometrics Panel.

6Total number of 2008 journal submissions to the RAE Economics and Econometrics Panel.

APPENDIX V

Distribution of Undergraduate and Post-graduate Students Among Research and Non-Research Among Universities

**1992 RAE Ranking**

**(1994-1995 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree1 | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| Research Rating-5 | 10 | 775 | 1,010 | 3,855 | 45.30 | 38.60 | 21.90 |
| Research Rating-4 | 9 | 410 | 555 | 2,590 | 24.00 | 21.20 | 14.70 |
| Research Rating-3 | 14 | 265 | 525 | 3,700 | 15.50 | 20.10 | 21.00 |
| Research Rating-2 | 9 | 115 | 260 | 2,795 | 6.70 | 9.90 | 15.90 |
| Research Rating-1 | 4 | 5 | 0 | 695 | 0.30 | 0.00 | 3.90 |
| Non-Research Universities | 25 | 140 | 265 | 3,975 | 8.20 | 10.20 | 22.60 |
| Total | 71 | 1,710 | 2,615 | 17,610 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**1996 RAE Ranking**

**(1997-1998 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree1 | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| Research Rating-5\* | 3 | 320 | 460 | 1,585 | 16.41 | 16.20 | 9.00 |
| Research Rating-5 | 10 | 650 | 805 | 3,565 | 33.33 | 28.35 | 20.20 |
| Research Rating-4 | 11 | 525 | 520 | 3,385 | 26.92 | 18.31 | 19.10 |
| Research Rating-3a | 9 | 140 | 195 | 2,515 | 7.18 | 6.87 | 14.20 |
| Research Rating-3b | 2 | 20 | 95 | 325 | 1.03 | 3.35 | 1.80 |
| Research Rating-2 | 3 | 15 | 45 | 795 | 0.77 | 1.58 | 4.50 |
| Research Rating-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Non-Research Universities | 36 | 280 | 720 | 5,515 | 14.36 | 25.35 | 31.20 |
| Total | 74 | 1,950 | 2,840 | 17,685 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**2001 RAE Ranking**

**(2002-2003 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree1 | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| Research Rating-5\* | 4 | 310 | 605 | 2,360 | 17.80 | 16.00 | 12.20 |
| Research Rating-5 | 9 | 635 | 1,100 | 3,950 | 36.40 | 29.10 | 20.40 |
| Research Rating-4 | 11 | 310 | 825 | 4,610 | 17.80 | 21.80 | 23.90 |
| Research Rating-3a | 8 | 105 | 455 | 2,730 | 6.00 | 12.00 | 14.10 |
| Research Rating-3b | 1 | 15 | 35 | 160 | 0.80 | 0.90 | 0.80 |
| Research Rating-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Research Rating-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Non-Research Universities | 37 | 370 | 765 | 5,530 | 21.20 | 20.20 | 28.60 |
| Total | 70 | 1,745 | 3,785 | 19,345 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**2001 RAE Ranking**

**(2003-2004 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| Research Rating-5\* | 4 | 330 | 670 | 2,340 | 18.60 | 15.20 | 11.40 |
| Research Rating-5 | 9 | 625 | 1,315 | 4,130 | 35.20 | 29.80 | 20.10 |
| Research Rating-4 | 11 | 340 | 960 | 4,845 | 19.20 | 21.70 | 23.60 |
| Research Rating-3a | 8 | 100 | 610 | 2,825 | 5.60 | 13.80 | 13.80 |
| Research Rating-3b | 1 | 20 | 10 | 165 | 1.10 | 0.20 | 0.80 |
| Research Rating-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Research Rating-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Non-Research Universities | 33 | 360 | 850 | 6,200 | 20.30 | 19.30 | 30.3 |
| Total | 66 | 1,775 | 4,415 | 20,505 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**2001 RAE Ranking**

**(2004-2005 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| Research Rating-5\* | 4 | 300 | 620 | 2,665 | 17.00 | 14.60 | 12.80 |
| Research Rating-5 | 9 | 630 | 1,295 | 4,150 | 35.60 | 30.50 | 20.00 |
| Research Rating-4 | 11 | 365 | 930 | 5,185 | 20.70 | 21.90 | 24.90 |
| Research Rating-3a | 8 | 105 | 545 | 2,800 | 6.00 | 12.80 | 13.50 |
| Research Rating-3b | 1 | 10 | 15 | 135 | 0.60 | 0.40 | 0.60 |
| Research Rating-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Research Rating-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Non-Research Universities | 33 | 355 | 840 | 5,855 | 20.10 | 19.80 | 28.20 |
| Total | 66 | 1765 | 4,245 | 20,790 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**2001 RAE Ranking**

**(2005-2006 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| Research Rating-5\* | 4 | 315 | 495 | 2,635 | 16.80 | 13.00 | 12.40 |
| Research Rating-5 | 9 | 660 | 1,325 | 4,160 | 35.30 | 34.80 | 19.60 |
| Research Rating-4 | 11 | 405 | 785 | 5,320 | 21.70 | 20.70 | 25.10 |
| Research Rating-3a | 8 | 120 | 530 | 2,795 | 6.40 | 13.90 | 13.20 |
| Research Rating-3b | 1 | 0 | 0 | 245 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 1.10 |
| Research Rating-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Research Rating-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Non-Research Universities | 32 | 370 | 670 | 6,070 | 19.80 | 17.60 | 28.60 |
| Total | 65 | 1,870 | 3,805 | 21,225 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**2001 RAE Ranking**

**(2006-2007 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| Research Rating-5\* | 4 | 310 | 570 | 2,665 | 16.50 | 15.20 | 13.60 |
| Research Rating-5 | 9 | 660 | 1,210 | 4,110 | 35.10 | 32.40 | 20.90 |
| Research Rating-4 | 11 | 445 | 765 | 4,470 | 23.70 | 20.50 | 22.80 |
| Research Rating-3a | 8 | 105 | 545 | 2,680 | 5.60 | 14.50 | 13.70 |
| Research Rating-3b | 1 | 0 | 0 | 205 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 1.00 |
| Research Rating-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Research Rating-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Non-Research Universities | 33 | 360 | 650 | 5,490 | 19.10 | 17.40 | 28.00 |
| Total | 66 | 1,880 | 3740 | 19,620 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**2001 RAE Ranking**

**(2007-2008 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| Research Rating-5\* | 4 | 240 | 615 | 2,860 | 18.30 | 16.50 | 14.20 |
| Research Rating-5 | 9 | 485 | 1,205 | 4,245 | 37.00 | 32.30 | 21.00 |
| Research Rating-4 | 11 | 255 | 770 | 4,715 | 19.50 | 2070 | 23.40 |
| Research Rating-3a | 8 | 85 | 520 | 2,906 | 6.50 | 13.90 | 14.40 |
| Research Rating-3b | 1 | 0 | 0 | 230 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 1.10 |
| Research Rating-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Research Rating-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Non-Research Universities | 37 | 245 | 620 | 5,235 | 18.70 | 16.60 | 25.90 |
| Total | 70 | 1,310 | 3,730 | 20,190 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**2001 RAE Ranking**

**(2008-2009 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| Research Rating-5\* | 4 | 250 | 545 | 3,030 | 19.30 | 14.30 | 14.10 |
| Research Rating-5 | 9 | 460 | 1,225 | 4,720 | 35.50 | 32.00 | 21.90 |
| Research Rating-4 | 11 | 270 | 945 | 5,320 | 20.80 | 24.70 | 24.70 |
| Research Rating-3a | 8 | 60 | 520 | 2,840 | 4.70 | 13.60 | 13.30 |
| Research Rating-3b | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Research Rating-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Research Rating-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Non-Research Universities | 36 | 255 | 590 | 5,595 | 19.70 | 15.40 | 26.00 |
| Total | 69 | 1,295 | 3,825 | 21,505 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**2008 RAE Ranking**

**(2009-2010 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| 3.55-3.35 | 5 | 360 | 1170 | 3,915 | 27.90 | 25.70 | 16.70 |
| 3.15-2.95 | 8 | 320 | 900 | 5,075 | 24.80 | 19.80 | 21.90 |
| 2.90-2.45 | 12 | 335 | 1,680 | 5,700 | 26.00 | 36.90 | 24.60 |
| 2.25-1.70 | 3 | 30 | 140 | 1,220 | 2.30 | 3.00 | 5.30 |
| Non-Research Universities | 41 | 245 | 665 | 7,300 | 19.00 | 14.60 | 31.50 |
| Total | 69 | 1,290 | 4,555 | 23,210 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**2008 RAE Ranking**

**(2010-2011 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| 3.55-3.35 | 5 | 365 | 1,175 | 3,930 | 30.30 | 23.80 | 16.10 |
| 3.15-2.95 | 8 | 270 | 1,200 | 5,345 | 22.40 | 24.30 | 21.80 |
| 2.90-2.45 | 12 | 340 | 1,650 | 5,935 | 28.20 | 33.40 | 24.20 |
| 2.25-1.70 | 3 | 25 | 150 | 1,250 | 2.10 | 3.10 | 5.10 |
| Non-Research Universities | 40 | 205 | 810 | 8,020 | 17.00 | 16.40 | 32.80 |
| Total | 68 | 1,205 | 4,940 | 24,480 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

**2008 RAE Ranking**

**(2011-2012 Student Enrollment Information)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Postgraduate Research | Number of Postgraduate Taught | Number of First Degree | % Share of Postgraduate Research | % Share of Postgraduate Taught | % Share of First Degree |
| 3.55-3.35 | 5 | 410 | 1,235 | 4,090 | 31.90 | 23.90 | 16.10 |
| 3.15-2.95 | 8 | 285 | 1,080 | 5,550 | 22.20 | 20.90 | 21.80 |
| 2.90-2.45 | 12 | 335 | 2,025 | 6,110 | 26.10 | 39.00 | 24.00 |
| 2.25-1.70 | 3\* | 10 | 50 | 905 | 0.80 | 1.00 | 3.60 |
| Non-Research Universities | 38 | 245 | 785 | 8,800 | 19.00 | 15.20 | 34.50 |
| Total | 66 | 1,285 | 5,175 | 25,455 | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

\*London Metropolitan University asked the HESA to not release their student data.

*Notes*: Derived from economics student enrollment data supplied by the Higher Education Statistical Agency – contact the author for details.

1The first degree student data is obviously problematical for six universities; so some conservative adjustments have been made:

De Montfort University: 1997-98 first degree entry is increased from zero to 50—personal information (from

having taught economics at De Montfort during this time).

University of Hertfordshire: 1997-98 first degree entry is increased from zero to 120; 1994-95 and 2002-03 first degree entries of 215 and 60 respectively are used as the benchmarks.

London School of Economics: 1994-95 first degree entry is decreased from 1555 to 700; 1997-98 first degree entry of

745 is used as the benchmark.

Open University: 1994-95 first degree entry is increased from zero to 200; 1997-98 first degree entry is

increased from zero to 300; 2002-03 first degree entry is increased from zero to 400; 2003-04 first degree entry of 445 is used as the benchmark.

University of Manchester: 1994-95 first degree entry is increased from 20 to 700; 1997-98 first degree entry is

increased from 75 to 1000; 2002-03 first degree entry of 1430 is used as the benchmark.

University of the West of England: 1994-95 first degree entry is increased from zero to 200; 1997-98 first degree entry of

215 is used as the benchmark.

APPENDIX VI

Diamond List Journals and Department’s Perceptions of World Class, Core, Leading Journals

**Department’s Perceptions of What are Leading, Core, World-Class-International**

**Top Economic Journals in the 2001 RAE**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Universities** | | | | | | | | |
| **Diamond List Journals**1 | BI | EA | EX | KE | LEI | LI | NE | NO | SUR |
| *American Economic Review* |  |  | X | X | X | X |  | X |  |
| *Canadian Journal of Economics* |  |  |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| *Econometrica* |  |  |  |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| *Economic Inquiry* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Economic Journal* |  | X | X | X | X |  | X |  | X |
| *Economic Letters* |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| *Economica* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| *European Economics Review* |  |  |  | X | X |  |  | X |  |
| *International Economic Review* | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Development Economics* |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Econometrics* | X |  |  | X | X |  |  | X |  |
| *Journal of Economic Literature* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Economic Theory* | X |  | X |  |  | X |  | X |  |
| *Journal of Financial Economics* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of International Economics* |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Labor Economics* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Law and Economics* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Mathematical Economics* | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Monetary Economics* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| *Journal of Political Economy* |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Public Economics* |  |  |  | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| *Oxford Economic Papers* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | X | X |
| *Quarterly Journal of Economics* |  | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| *Rand Journal of Economics* |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Review of Economics and Statistics* |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| *Review of Economic Studies* |  | X | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |

**Department’s Perceptions of What are World Class-International**

**Top Economic Journals in the 2008 RAE**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Diamond List Journals**1 | B | BC | BR | EA | ES | EX | LO | LSE | M | QM | RH | SH | SU | UCL | W |
| *American Economic Review* | X | X | X | X |  | X |  | X | X | X | X |  | X |  | X |
| *Canadian Journal of Economics* |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Econometrica* | X |  |  | X |  |  |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| *Economic Inquiry* |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Economic Journal* | X |  | X | X |  | X |  | X |  |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| *Economic Letters* |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| *Economica* |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| *European Economics Review* | X |  |  |  |  | X |  |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| *International Economic Review* | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| *Journal of Development Economics* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Econometrics* |  |  | X |  | X |  |  | X |  | X | X |  |  | X |  |
| *Journal of Economic Literature* |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |  | X | X |  |
| *Journal of Economic Theory* |  | X |  | X | X | X |  |  | X | X | X |  |  | X | X |
| *Journal of Financial Economics* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of International Economics* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Labor Economics* |  |  |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Law and Economics* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Mathematical Economics* |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Monetary Economics* |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Journal of Political Economy* | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| *Journal of Public Economics* | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| *Oxford Economic Papers* |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| *Quarterly Journal of Economics* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| *Rand Journal of Economics* | X |  |  | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Review of Economics and Statistics* |  | X |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| *Review of Economic Studies* |  | X |  |  | X |  |  | X |  | X | X | X |  | X | X |

1One Diamond List journals was not mentioned and hence is not included: *Brookings Papers*

B – University of Bristol

BC – Birkbeck College

BI – University of Birmingham

BR – Brunel University

EA – University of East Anglia

ES – University of Essex

EX – University of Exeter

KE – Keele University

LEI – University of Leicester

LI – University of Liverpool

LO – Loughborough University

LSE – London School of Economics

M – University of Manchester

NE – University of Newcastle

NO – University of Nottingham

QM – Queen Mary, University of London

RH – Royal Holloway, University of London

SH – University of Sheffield

SU - University of Sussex

SUR – University of Surrey

UCL – University of College London

W – University of Warwick

Drawn from the RA5a – Research Environment and Esteem section of the 2001 and 2008 RAE submission:

see <http://www.rae.ac.uk/2001/submissions/Inst.asp?UoA=38>.

see <http://www.rae.ac.uk/submissions/submissions.aspx?id=34&type=uoa>.

APPENDIX VII

Heterodox Economics and the Research Assessment Exercise

**1992 RAE1**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Universities in the Sample | Number of Staff2 | Number of Economists Submitted with Publications | Number of Heterodox Economists | Number of Heterodox Submissions | Number of History of Economic Thought Submissions | Total Submissions | Number of Universities with No Heterodox Economists |
| Research  Rating-5 | 10 | 5 | 170.9 | 187 | 5 | 6 | 6 | 368 | 1 |
| Research  Rating-4 | 9 | 4 | 83.8 | 92 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 175 | 3 |
| Research Rating-3 | 14 | 8 | 110 | 111 | 8 | 5 | 14 | 213 | 4 |
| Research Rating-2 | 9 | 4 | 44 | 44 | 10 | 14 | 1 | 84 | 1 |
| Research Rating-1 | 4 | 0 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Total | 46 | 21 | 408.7 | 434 | 24 | 27 | 23 | 840 | 9 |

1Source: Twenty-one 1992 RAE Economic Departments Publications Submissions Collected by John R. Presely in 1993-1994. Copies in the possession of the author (Lee).

2Taken from “Research Assessment Exercise 1992: The Outcome,” Circular 26/92, Table 41. <Http://www.rae.ac.uk/1992/c26_92t41.html>.

**2001 RAE1**

(for research-rated submissions in economics)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Staff2 | Number of Economists Submitted | Number of Heterodox Economists | Number of Heterodox Submissions | Number of History of Economic Thought and Methodology Submissions | Total Submissions | Number of Universities with No Heterodox Economists in their Submissions |
| Research  Rating-5\* | 4 | 142.8 | 147 | 2 | 9 | 3 | 559 | 2 |
| Research  Rating-5 | 9 | 279.2 | 294 | 14 | 25 | 5 | 1107 | 5 |
| Research Rating-4 | 11 | 183.5 | 192 | 9 | 17 | 15 | 686 | 8 |
| Research Rating-3a/b | 9 | 112.6 | 116 | 19 | 22 | 11 | 437 | 3 |
| Total | 33 | 718.2 | 749 | 44 | 73 | 32 | 2789 | 18 |

1Derived from the submissions to the 2001 RAE: <http://www.rae.ac.uk>.

2Taken from “2001 Research Assessment Exercise, Unit of Assessment: 38 Economics and Econometrics.” <Http://www.rae.ac.uk/2001/results/byuoa38.html>.

**2001 RAE1**

(for research-rated heterodox submissions outside of economics by heterodox economists)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities with Submissions in Economics | Number of Universities with Heterodox Submissions outside of Economics | Number of Heterodox Economists in Business and Management Studies | Number of Heterodox Economists in Social Policy and Administration | Number of Heterodox Economists in Geography | Number of Heterodox Economists in Other Assessment Areas | Number of Heterodox Economics Submissions | Number of History of Economic Thought and Methodology Submissions |
| Research  Rating-5\* | 4 | 1 | - | - | - | 1 | 2 | - |
| Research  Rating-5 | 9 | 3 | 8 | - | - | 4 | 12 | - |
| Research Rating-4 | 11 | 1 | - | 1 | 1 | - | 1 | - |
| Research Rating-3a/b | 9 | 1 | 1 | 1 | - | - | 1 | - |
| Other Research Universities | - | 15 | 29 | 4 | 12 | 5 | 96 | 2 |
| Total | 33 | 21 | 38 | 6 | 13 | 10 | 112 | 2 |

1Derived from the submissions to the 2001 RAE: <http://www.rae.ac.uk>.

**2008 RAE1**

(for research-rated submissions in economics)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Staff2 | Number of Economists Submitted with Publications | Number of Heterodox Economists | Number of Heterodox Submissions | Number of History of Economic Thought Submissions | Total Submissions | Number of Universities with No Heterodox Economists in their Submissions |
| Research  Rating-3.55-3.35 | 5 | 235.91 | 246 | 13 | 2 | 0 | 817 | 4 |
| Research  Rating-3.15-2.95 | 8 | 225.75 | 227 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 807 | 5 |
| Research Rating-2.90-2.45 | 12 | 239.83 | 257 | 7 | 12 | 10 | 905 | 7 |
| Research Rating-2.25-1.70 | 3 | 16.75 | 19 | 7 | 7 | 9 | 75 | 1 |
| Total | 28 | 718.24 | 749 | 20 | 27 | 26 | 2604 | 17 |

1Derived from the submissions to the 2008 RAE: <http://www.rae.ac.uk>.

2Taken from “RAE 2008 Quality Profiles: UOA 34 Economics and Econometrics.” <Http://submissions.rae.ac.uk/results/qualityProfile.aspx?id=34&type=uoa>.

3This economist actually died just after the closing date for submissions.

**2008 RAE1**

(for research-rated heterodox submissions outside of economics by economists)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Number of Universities | Number of Universities with Heterodox Submissions outside of Economics | Number of Heterodox Economists in Business and Management Studies | Number of Heterodox Economists in Development Studies | Number of Heterodox Economists in Sociology | Number of Heterodox Economists in Other Assessment Areas | Number of Heterodox Economics Submissions | Number of History of Economic Thought and Methodology Submissions |
| Research  Rating-3.55-3.35 | 5 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 0 |
| Research  Rating-3.15-2.95 | 8 | 3 | 8 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 12 | 4 |
| Research Rating-2.90-2.45 | 12 | 10 | 6 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 15 | 0 |
| Research Rating-2.25-1.70 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 4 |
| Other Research Universities | - | 21 | 32 | 14 | 5 | 4 | 94 | 10 |
| Total | 28 | 39 | 48 | 18 | 7 | 7 | 130 | 18 |

1Derived from the submissions to the 2008 RAE: <http://www.rae.ac.uk>.

# APPENDIX VIII

# Department Location of Heterodox Economists in Universities and other Higher Education Institutions in England, 1992-2012

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| UNIVERSITY/  ECONOMIST | 1992 RAE Submissions1 | 1996-20004 Survey | 2001 RAE Submissions2 | 2002 – 034 Survey | 2008RAE Submissions3 | 20124 Survey |
| **Anglia Ruskin** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| I. Negru | - | - | - | - | - | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Bath** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| A. Charles | - | - | - | - | - | O |
| D. Collard | E | E | O | E | - | - |
| S. Johnson | - | - | - | - | O | O |
| T. Subasat | - | - | - | E | O | - |
| P. Tomlinson | - | - | - | O | O | O |
| A. Winnett | E | E | O | E | O | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Birkbeck** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| B. Fine | E | - | - | - | - | - |
| F. Guy | - | O | O | O | O | O |
| J. Michie | - | O | O | O | - | - |
| K. Nielsen | - | - | - | O | O | O |
| C. Oughton | - | - | O | O | O | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Birmingham** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| R. Connolly | - | - | - | - | - | O |
| J. Michie | - | - | - | - | O | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bradford |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| M. Baimbridge | - | E | - | E | - | E |
| B. Burkitt | - | E | O | O | - | - |
| V. Fitzsimons | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| F. Hutchinson | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| W. Olsen | - | E | O | - | - | - |
| G. Slater | - | - | - | - | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Brighton** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| J. Holscher | - | - | O | O | O | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Cambridge** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| M. Baddeley | - | E | E | O | - | E |
| S. Blankenburg | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| H. Chang | - | E | E | E | E | E |
| K. Coutts | - | E | - | E | - | E |
| J. Eatwell | - | E | E | E | O | O |
| W. Godley | - | E/O | - | O | - | - |
| G. Harcourt | - | E | - | E | - | - |
| M. Hayes | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| G. Hodgson | - | O | - | - | - | - |
| K. Humphries | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| M. Kitson | - | E | E | O | O | O |
| C. Lawson | - | E | - | E | - | E |
| T. Lawson | - | E | E | E | E | E |
| P. Lewis | - | E/O | - | E | - | - |
| J. McCombie | - | O | O | O | O | O |
| P. Nolan | - | O | O | O | O | - |
| J. Palma | - | O | E | - | E | E |
| C. Pitelis | - | O | O | O | O | O |
| M. Roberts | - | - | - | E | - | O |
| J. Runde | - | O | O | O | O | O |
| A. Shipman | - | O | - | O | - | - |
| J. S. Smith |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| H. Sutherland | - | E | E | E | - | - |
| J. Wells | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| S. Wilkinson | - | E | E | E | - | - |
| M. Wrenn | - | - | - | - | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Central Lancashire |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| P. Whyman | - | O | O | O | O | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **City** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| A. Denis | - | E | - | E | E | E |
| J. Hatgioannides | - | - | - | - | - | O |
| A. Nesvetailova | - | - | - | - | O | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| De Montfort |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| S. Fleetwood | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| F. Lee | E | E | - | - | - | - |
| S. Parsons | E | E | - | - | O | O |
| S. Pashkoff | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| J. Pheby | E | E | - | - | - | - |
| S. Pratten | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| P. Riach | E | E | - | - | - | - |
| M. Williams | - | E | - | - | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **East Anglia** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| G. Brownlow | - | E | - | E | - | - |
| K. Cole | - | O | - | O | - | - |
| S. Hargreaves-Heap | - | E | E | E | E | E |
| R. Jenkins | - | O | O | O | O | O |
| J. Mehta | - | E | - | E | - | - |
| C. Starmer | - | E | E | - | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **East London** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| P. Arestis | E | E | E | - | - | - |
| I. Biefang | - | E | E | - | - | - |
| A. Brown | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| M. De Angelis | - | E | E | E | O | O |
| C. Fuller | - | E | - | E | - | O |
| M. Glickman | - | E | E | E | - | - |
| P. Howells | E | E | E | - | - | - |
| M. Marshall | E | E | E | E | - | - |
| F. Skuse | E | - | - | - | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Essex** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D. Elson | - | - | O | O | O | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Greenwich |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| R. Ayers | - | E | - | E | - | - |
| L. Catchpowle | - | O | - | O | O | O |
| B. Cronin | - | - | - | O | O | E |
| A. Freeman | - | E | - | E | - | - |
| H. Mercer | - | - | - | - | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Hertfordshire |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| S. Barrientos | - | E | O | - | - | - |
| H. Dagdeviren | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| D. Dollimore | - | - | - | - | - | O |
| F. Gagliardi | - | - | - | - | - | O |
| D. Gindis | - | - | - | - | - | O |
| J. Hardy | - | E | O | E | O | E |
| C. J. Haslam | - | - | - | - | O | O |
| G. Hodgson | - | E | O | E | O | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Institute of Education** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F. Green | - | - | - | - | - | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Keele** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| M. Brannan | - | - | - | - | O | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Kent** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| M. Leon-Ledesma | - | E | E | E | E | E |
| A. P. Thirlwall | - | E | E | E | E | E |
| F. Green | - | - | E | - | E | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **King’s College London** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| P. Lewis | - | - | - | - | O | O |
| S. Pratten | - | - | O | - | O | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Kingston |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| P. Auerbach | - | E | - | E | - | E |
| S. Daniel | - | E | - | E | - | - |
| I. Levina | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| F. Murphy | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| N. Sarantis | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| D. Sotiropoulos | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| E. Stockhammer | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| R. van den Berg | - | - | - | O | O | O |
| J. Wells | - | - | - | E | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Lancaster |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| S. Fleetwood | - | O | O | O | - | - |
| D. Sapsford | - | E | O | - | - | - |
| G. Steele | - | E | O | E | O | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Leeds |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| A. Brown | - | - | - | E | O | E |
| D. Coffey | - | - | - | O | O | E |
| C. Dannreuther | - |  | O | O | O | O |
| G. Dymski | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| G. Fontana | - | E | O | E | O | E |
| J. Hillard | - | O | - | O | - | O |
| K. Hubacek | - | - | - | O | - | - |
| A. Kaltenbrunner | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| S. Kayatekin | - | E | O | E | - | - |
| S. Kestings | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| H. Radice | - | O | O | O | - | - |
| M. Sawyer | - | E | O | E | O | - |
| D. Spencer | - | E | O | E | O | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Leeds Metropolitan |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| J. Morgan | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| D. Otter | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| K. Petrick | - | E | O | E | - | - |
| B. Sheehan | - | E | - | E | - | E |
| D. Sugden | - | - | - | - | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Leicester** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| M. Brannan | - | - | - | O | - | - |
| F. Green | E | - | - | - | - | - |
| D. Harvie | - | - | - | - | O | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Lincoln** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| P. Clarke | - | E | - | O | O | - |
| A. Mearman | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| D. Sugden | - | E | - | - | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Liverpool** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D. Sapsford | - | - | - | - | O | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **London Guildhall5** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| J. Coakley | E | - | E | - | - | - |
| G. Hadjimatheou | E | E | - | - | - | - |
| N. Sarantis | - | E | E | - | - | - |
| A. Witztum | - |  | E | - | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| North London6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F. Brouwer | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| J. Grahl | - | E | O | - | - | - |
| P. Lysandrou | - | E | O | - | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **London Metropolitan7** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F. Brouwer | - | - | - | E | - | - |
| W. Dixon | - | - | - | E | E | E |
| J. Grahl | - | - | - | E | - | - |
| P. Lysandrou | - | - | - | E | E | E |
| N. Sarantis | - | - | - | E | E | - |
| A. Witztum | - | - | - | E | E | E |
| P. Wynarczyk | - | - | - | - | - | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **London School of Economics** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| M. Desai | - | E | E | - | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Loughborough University** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| P. Downward | - | - | - | - | O | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Victoria Manchester8** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| P. Devine | - | E | E | E | - | - |
| W. Olsen | - | - | - | O | - | - |
| H. Ozanne | - | E | E | E | - | - |
| B. Walters | - | E | E | E | - | - |
| D. Young | - | E | E | E | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **UMIST8** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D. Grimshaw | - | - | O | O | - | - |
| M. Miozzo | - | - | O | O | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Manchester8** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D. Grimshaw | - | - | - | - | O | O |
| M. Miozzo | - | - | - | - | O | O |
| W. Olsen | - | - | - | - | O | O |
| H. Ozanne | - | - | - | - | E | E |
| B. Walters | - | - | - | - | O | - |
| D. Young | - | - | - | - | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Manchester Metropolitan** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| K. Gibbard | - | E | - | E | - | - |
| J. Kemp | - | E | E | E | - | - |
| T. Ndhlove | - | E | E | E | E | E |
| B. Philp | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| I. Steedman | - | E | E | E | E | - |
| J. Tomkins | - | E | E | E | - | - |
| J. Vint | - | E | - | E | - | - |
| G. Zis | - | E | E | E | E | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Middlesex |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| V. Allsopp | - | E | - | E | - | - |
| A. Brown | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| J. Dunne | - | E | O | - | - | - |
| J. G. Grahl | - | - | - | - | O | O |
| E. Paligins | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| D. Saal | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| G. Wood | - | - | - | O | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Newcastle** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| J. Wheelock | - | O | O | O | O | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Northumbria |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| M. Hayes | - | - | - | O | - | - |
| M. Mellor | - | - | O | - | O | - |
| J. Roberts | - | - | E | - | - | O |
| P. Wynarczyk | - | E | E | E | O | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Nottingham Trent |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D. Harvie | - | E | O | E | - | - |
| G. Ibrahim | - | - | - | O | O | - |
| B. Philp | - | - | O | E | O | E |
| G. Slater | - | - | - | E | - | - |
| D. Wheatley | - | - | - | - | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Open |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| N. Costello | - | E | O | - | - | - |
| G. Dawson | - | E | O | E | - | - |
| S. Himmelweit | - | E | O | E | O | E |
| J. Mehta | - | E | O | E | - | - |
| A. Shipman | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| R. Simonetti | - |  | O |  | - | E |
| G. Thompson | - | E | O | E | O | O |
| A. Trigg | - | E | - | E | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Oxford |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| O. R. Darbishire | - | O | O | O | - | O |
| J. Forder | - | E | E | E | - | E |
| B. Harris-White | - | - | E | - | O | - |
| J. Humphries | - | - | O | O | O | O |
| A. Glyn | - | E | E | E | E | - |
| J. Michie | - | - | - | - | - | O |
| M. Sako | - | O | O | O | O | O |
| J. Toye | - | E | E | E | O | O |
| C. Repapis | - | - | - | - | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Oxford Brookes |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| A. Kilmister | - | E | - | E | - | E |
| J. Piggott | - | E | - | E | - | O |
| H. Sezer | - | E | - | E | - | E |
| P. Singh | - | - | - | E | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Plymouth |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| A. Ward | - | O | - | O | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Queen Mary |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| J.-M. Albala-Bertrand | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| B. Corry | E | E | - | - | - | - |
| J. Grahl | E | E | E | - | - | - |
| M. Karanassou | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| S. Mohun | - | E | - | E | O | - |
| R. Veneziani | - | - | - | - | E | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Reading** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| M. Della Giusta | - | - | - | - | O | E |
| J. Latsis | - | - | - | - | - | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Roehampton** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| M. Cato Scott | - | - | - | - | - | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **School of Oriental and African Studies** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| S. Blankenburg | - | - | - | E | - | E |
| T. Byres | - | O | O | E | - | - |
| S. Deraniyagala | - | E | O | E | O | - |
| G. Dyer | - | E | O | E | - | E |
| B. Fine | - | E | O | E | O | E |
| D. Johnston | - | - | - | E | O | E |
| M. Karshenas | - | E | O | E | O | E |
| M. Khan | - | E | O | E | O | E |
| C. Lapavitas | - | E | O | E | O | E |
| D. Lo | - | E | O | E | O | E |
| M. McCartney | - | - | - | E | - | - |
| M. Nissanke | - | E | O | E | O | E |
| C. Oughton | - | - | - | - | - | O |
| C. Oya | - | - | - | O | O | O |
| A. Saad Filho | - | E | O | E | O | O |
| J. Toporowski | - |  | - |  | O | E |
| J. Weeks | - | E | O | E | O | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Sheffield** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| M. Dietrich | - | E | E | E | - | E |
| J. Perraton | - | E | E | E | E | E |
| A. Tylecote | - | O | O | O | O | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **South Bank** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| P. Arestis | - | E | O | - | - | - |
| G. Ietto-Gillies | - | E | O | - | O | - |
| A. Saad Filho | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| J. Toporowski | - | E | - | E | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Southampton Solent University** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| N. Potts | - | O | - | O | - | O |
| S. Mouatt | - | O | - | O | - | O |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Staffordshire** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| P. Considine | - | - | - | O | - | E |
| P. Downward | E | E | O | E | - | - |
| S. Dunn | - | E | O | - | - | - |
| I. Hashi | E | E | O | E | - | E |
| P. Reynolds | E | E | O | E | - | - |
| I. Seyf | E | E | O | E | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Sussex** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F. Brouwer | - | - | - | - | - | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Surrey** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D. Reisman | E | E | E | E | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| University College London |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| R. Biel | - | - | - | - | - | O |
| V. Chick | - | E | E | E | - | - |
| G. Ive | - | O | O | - | O | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Warwick |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| K. Cowling | E | E | E | E | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| West of England |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| I. Biefang | - | - | - | E | O | E |
| K. Bruce | - | - | - | O | - | - |
| P. Dunne | - | - | - | E | O | - |
| S. Fleetwood | - | - | - |  | O | O |
| E. Fullbrook | - | - | - | E | - | - |
| P. Howells | - | - | - | E | O | - |
| N. Kaul | - | - | - | E | - | - |
| G. Mahony | - | E | - | - | - | - |
| A. Mearman | - | - | - | E | O | E |
| S. Perlo-Freeman | - | - | - | E | O | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Westminster** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| H. Goodacre | - | - | - | - | - | E |
| M. Williams | - | - | - | O | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| York |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| B. Gerrard | E | - | - | - | - | - |
| W. Jackson | E | E | E | E | E | E |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Total Economics** | 24 | 130 | 44 | 106 | 20 | 78 |
| **Total Other** |  | 24 | 67 | 48 | 79 | 57 |
| **Total** | 24 | 154 | 111 | 154 | 99 | 135 |

Department Location:

E **Economics**: which includes engagement in economic research and/or providing

instruction, mentoring, support, or supervision to economic students pursuing undergraduate and/or post-graduate degrees in economics. Emeritus professors, honorary fellows, research associates, and similar positions are excluded.

O **Other**: which includes Business and Management, Built Environment, Sociology, Social Policy, Land Economy, Development Studies, International Relations, and other departments.

- Represents the absence of data for many reasons, including that the individual no longer resides at the institution (such as teaching elsewhere or retiring), the individual’s research was not submitted to the RAE, or the individual ceased to engage with heterodox economics.

1Source: Twenty-one 1992 RAE Economic Departments Publications Submissions Collected by John R. Presely in 1993-1994. Copies in the possession of the author (Lee).

2Based on the submissions to the 2001 RAE: <http://www.rae.ac.uk>.

3Based on the Submissions to the 2008 RAE: <http://www.rae.ac.uk>.

4Compiled by the author (Lee).

5Merged with North London University in 2002 to form London Metropolitan University.

6Merged with London Guildhall University in 2002 to form London Metropolitan University.

7London Metropolitan University is given a 2001 RAE ranking of 3 based on the London Guildhall ranking.

8Victoria Manchester and UMIST merged in 2003/4 to form Manchester University

APPENDIX IX

Hiring and Staff Composition of UK Economics Departments, 1992 – 2000

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1996 RAE  Research  Rating | Number of  Departments | Number of Staff, 1996 RAE1 | Hiring Mainstream Economists, 1992-94 | Hiring Heterodox Economists, 1992-94 | Number of Departments without Heterodox Economists | Number of Heterodox Economists, 1996-2000 |
| 5\* | 3 | 114 | 25 | 0 | 0 | 5 |
| 5 | 10 | 256 | 58 | 1 | 7 | 17 |
| 4 | 11 | 187 | 51 | 1 | 6 | 14 |
| 3a/b | 11 | 113 | 39 | 19 | 4 | 39 |
| 2 | 3 | 21 | 13 | 2 | 0 | 7 |
| Non-Research Rated | 36 | - | 392 | 142 | 21 | 48 |
| Total | 74 | 671 | 225 | 37 | 38 | 130 |

Source: Drawn from Lee (2009: Appendix 18), Appendix VIII, and the 1994 Survey

1Derived from HEFCE funding data: <http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20100202100434/http:/hefce.ac.uk/research/funding/qrfunding/previous.asp>

2Based on the replies from twenty departments in the 1994 survey.

APPENDIX X

2001, 2008, and 2014 Economics Panels Members: RAE/REF Submission and Professional Characteristics

**2001 Research Assessment Exercise Economics Panel**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Diamond**  **List Journal Submissions (based on submissions to 2001 RAE)** | **Heterodox Submissions (based on submissions to 2001 RAE)** | **Other Submissions (based on submissions to 2001 RAE)** | **RES Leadership Positions** | **Managing/**  **Associate**  **Editor of the *Economic Journal*** | **CHUDE**  **Steering**  **Committee** | **Managing/**  **Associate**  **Editor of a Diamond List Journal** | **ESRC**  **Activities** | **Other** |
| D. Greenaway (chair)  (Nottingham) | 3 | 0 | 1 | X | X | X |  | X |  |
| P. Arestis  (South Bank) | 2 | 0 | 0 | X | X | X |  |  | QAA1 |
| J. Beath  (St. Andrews) | 0 | 0 | 4 | X |  | X |  | X | QAA1 |
| R. Blundell  (UCL) | 3 | 0 | 1 | X |  |  | Emet, JEmet, REStud |  |  |
| A. Booth  (Essex) | 4 | 0 | 0 | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| M. Desai  (LSE) | 0 | 3 | 1 | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| N. Ireland  (Warwick) | 1 | 0 | 3 |  |  | X |  |  | QAA1 |
| V. A. Muscatelli  (Glasgow) | 4 | 0 | 0 | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| D. Osborn  (Manchester) | 0 | 0 | 4 | X |  | X |  | X | QAA1 |
| C. Propper  (Bristol) | 1 | 0 | 3 | X |  |  |  |  |  |

**2008 Research Assessment Exercise Economics Panel**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Diamond**  **List Journal Submissions (based on submissions to 2008 RAE)** | **Heterodox Submissions (based on submissions to 2008 RAE)** | **Other Submissions (based on submissions to 2008 RAE)** | **RES Leadership Positions** | **Managing/**  **Associate**  **Editor of the *Economic Journal*** | **CHUDE**  **Steering**  **Committee** | **Managing/**  **Associate**  **Editor of a Diamond List Journal** | **ESRC**  **Activities** | **Other** |
| D. Osborn  (chair)  (Manchester) | 1 | 0 | 3 | X | X | X |  | X | ESRC-RES, QAA1, QAA2 |
| D. Blackaby  (Swansea) | 2 | 0 | 2 |  |  | X |  | X | QAA1, QAA2 |
| S. Broadberry  (Warwick) | 0 | 0 | 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| A. Carruth  (Kent) | 2 | 0 | 2 | X |  | X |  |  | QAA1, QAA2 |
| J. Dutta  (Birming-ham) | 2 | 0 | 2 |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| S. Ghatak  (Kingston) | 0 | 0 | 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| C. Leith  (Glasgow) | 4 | 0 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| P. Neary  (Oxford) | 4 | 0 | 0 | X | X |  | Emet, Ecca, EER, REStud, JIE |  |  |
| C. Pissarides  (LSE) | 3 | 0 | 1 | X | X |  | Ecca |  |  |
| J. Thomas  (Edinburgh) | 3 | 0 | 1 | X |  |  |  |  |  |

**2014 Research Excellence Funding Economics Panel**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Diamond**  **List Journal Submissions (based on submissions to 2008 RAE)** | **Heterodox Submissions (based on submissions to 2008 RAE)** | **Other Submissions (based on submissions to 2008 RAE)** | **RES Leadership Positions** | **Managing/**  **Associate**  **Editor of the *Economic Journal*** | **CHUDE**  **Steering**  **Committee** | **Managing/**  **Associate**  **Editor of a Diamond List Journal** | **ESRC**  **Activities** | **Other** |
| P. Neary (chair)  (Oxford) | 4 | 0 | 0 | X | X |  | Emet, Ecca, EER, REStud, JIE |  |  |
| O. Bandiera  (LSE) | 3 | 0 | 1 | X | X |  | JEL, JDE |  |  |
| T. Besley  (LSE) | 3 | 0 | 1 | X | X |  | QJE, JDE, AER, OEP, REStud | X |  |
| D. Blackaby  (Swansea) | 2 | 0 | 2 | X |  | X |  | X | QAA1, QAA2 |
| S. Bond  (Oxford) | 3 | 0 | 1 |  |  |  | Ecca | X |  |
| S. Brown  (Sheffield) | 1 | 0 | 3 |  |  | X |  | X |  |
| S. Gaechter  (Nottingham) | 1 | 0 | 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| R. Griffith  (Manchester) | 4 | 0 | 0 | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| A. Harvey  (Cambridge) | 2 | 0 | 2 |  |  |  | JEmet |  |  |
| C. Leith  (Glasgow) | 4 | 0 | 0 |  |  |  | EER | X |  |
| B. Lockwood  (Warwick) | 4 | 0 | 0 |  | X |  | JPE |  |  |
| S. Pudney  (Essex) | 2 | 0 | 2 |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| A. Sutherland  (St. Andrews) | 2 | 0 | 2 |  |  |  | JIE |  |  |
| J. Thomas  (Edinburgh) | 3 | 0 | 1 | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| I. Walker  (Lancaster) | 3 | 0 | 1 | X |  |  |  |  |  |

AER -*American Economic Review*

Ecca - *Economica*

Emet - *Econometrica*

EER - *European Economics Review*

JDE - *Journal of Development Economics*

JEmet - *Journal of Econometrics*

JEL - *Journal of Economics Literature*

JIE *- Journal of International Economics*

JPE – *Journal of Public Economics*

OEP - *Oxford Economics Papers*

QJE - *Quarterly Journal of Economics*

REStud - *Review of Economic Studies*

Economics and Social Research Council activities included grants assessment panel, PEG Research College, ESRC-DFID grants panel, ESRC Resources Board, and others

ESRC-RES International Benchmarking Review

QQA1 – Membership on the 2000 QAA Benchmarking Group for Economics

QQA2 – Membership on the 2007 QQA Benchmarking Review Group for Economics